

ASI-ACCREDITATION SERVICES INTERNATIONAL GmbH

Charles-de-Gaulle-Str. 5 • 53113 Bonn, Germany • Tel.: +49 - 228 - 367 66 0 • info@accreditation-services.com

FSC Annual Surveillance of BV for 2008

Forest Management Assessment to

Washington Department of Natural Resources
South Puget HCP Planning Unit
Olympia, WA (USA)
(BV-FM/COC-080501)

Date of assessment: 01-02 December 2008

(FINAL)

	NAME	DATE
Report drafted by:	Paolo Tranquillini	16 March 2009
Reviewed by ASI:	Frank Katto	17 March 2009
Reviewed by CAB:	Héloïse d'Huart	27 April 2009
Finalized by ASI:	Paolo Tranquillini	22 May 2009
Report last updated:		

Credits

The author would like to thank Héloïse d'Huart as well as Brian Callaghan from Bureau Veritas Certification (BV) as well as Lislle Sayers and Gretchen Nicholas from Washington Department of Natural Resources (WDNR) for preparing and making the arrangements that made this assessment possible and efficient.

1 Background

The operation assessed by BV

Name of operation	Washington Department of Natural Resources South Puget Sound Habitat Conservation Plan (HCP) Planning Unit
Total area	58,530 hectares ha
Type of management	Pacific NW temperate semi-natural softwood forest
Name of contact person	Lislle Sayers
Address	1111 Washington St. SE, PO Box 47016, Olympia, WA 98504
Country	USA
Phone number	360-902-2896
Fax number	360-902-1789
URL	www.dnr.wa.gov
E-mail address	lislle.sayers@wadnr.gov

The certification history

Pre-assessment	30 January – 01 February 2007
Main assessment:	25 - 28 June 2007
Date of certificate issue	15 May 2008
Date of 1st surveillance	01-02 December 2008 'special surveillance' (this assessment)
Date of 2nd surveillance	

ASI Assessment Details

Purpose of assessment	FM surveillance of BV 2008
ASI lead assessor	Paolo Tranquillini
Local Expert/ translator	-
Assessment language	English
Sites assessed	WDNR office and site visits

Assessment agenda

01 December 2008	
0830	Opening meeting – Update from WDNR
1000	Review of CARs
1300	Interview (timber sales invoicing)

FSC Chain of Custody Surveillance Assessment of BV for 2008: Washington DNR

1400	Logo use approval
1420	CAR 05 (regeneration harvest size)
1500	Policy for sustainable forestry
1600	CAR 04 (stocking and growth)
1730-1745	Adjourn of the day 1
02 December 2008	
0830	Field trip to Elbe recreational forest / Tahoma block <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Sahara Creek campground and trailhead - Fortune Timber Sale Unit 4 - South Timber Sale Unit 2 - Cherry Pit - View Eager Beaver Timber Sale
1320-1400	Interim BV communication of findings to WDNR ASI feedback to BV based on above.
ASI left - BV audit was scheduled to continue through the day	

People involved in the assessment

CAB	Brian Callaghan, Lead Auditor Héloïse d'Huart, BV HQ FM Account Manager (Observer)
Operation	Gretchen Nicholas, Division Manager Angus Brodie, Assistant Division Manager Allen Estep, FSC Certification Program Leader Lislie Sayers, FSC Certification Coordinator Tami Miketa, Ecosystem Services Manager John Tweedale, Dave Gordon, Farra Vargas, Craig Partridge, Pete Holmberg, Bob Aulds, Jeff De Graan Mark Thibo, State Lands Assistant Ted Keeley, Unit Forester
Others	-

2 Assessment objectives and planning

The objectives of this forest management surveillance assessment are:

1. Evaluation of certification body's performance in implementing the accredited certification system in accordance with FSC accreditation requirements.
2. Witness an assessment team to determine whether or not the team:
 - a) adequately applies the procedures and instructions of the certification body;
 - b) members exhibit the characteristics of an assessor as detailed in ISO 19011;
 - c) has the required expertise of the sector in which the assessment is being undertaken;
 - d) applies appropriate expertise in the correct sense;
 - e) undertakes the assessment effectively and draws correct conclusions.
3. Evaluation of the conformity of the certificate holder with FSC and certification body's certification requirements in so far as this is necessary to verify the performance of the certification body.
4. Evaluation of stakeholder comments or complaints ASI received in relation to this operation.

ASI annual surveillance assessments are conducted as “*witness assessments*” and are based on a sample of the valid certificates of the assessed CB within the scope of accreditation. The number of assessments per year is determined by ASI surveillance policy; sampling is based on the ASI sampling procedure. Due to the nature of the ASI surveillance procedure, the assessment evidence is only based on a sample of the information available and therefore there is always an element of uncertainty in the assessment findings.

3 ASI stakeholder consultation process

The stakeholder consultation process employed by ASI consists of 2 parts:

1. public announcement of the assessment on the FSC electronic fora and on the ASI website about one month prior to the assessment to solicit stakeholder comments;
2. direct interviews with selected key-stakeholders mainly conducted by the contracted local expert prior, during and after the assessment.

Stakeholder comments	ASI response
No comment received	

(See Local Expert’s report attached for details; ASI version only)

4 Assessment findings

CAB ASSESSMENT PERFORMANCE	
FSC requirements	Findings and conclusions
Standard adaptation (20-003)	NA (FSC FM standard Pacific Coast US RF03)
Auditor qualification (20-004)	BV experienced auditor, focus and control on the audit and excellent time management.
Stakeholder consultation (20-006)	The audit schedule did not include the

FSC Chain of Custody Surveillance Assessment of BV for 2008: Washington DNR

	composition of the audit team. REC.BV.FM.USA.2008.01
Evaluation process (20-007; ISO 19011)	BV undertook this as interim audit (follow-up) due to the delay in issuing the certificate (apparently the first surveillance being due in May/June 09). Hence this audit at Washington DNR was presented as 'special surveillance'. BV documented system does not define the special surveillance. Eg. if such special surveillance would be a supplementary visit (eg. to follow-up on issued CARs) or if it would account as one of the annual surveillances. CAR.BV.FM.USA.2008.02
Pre-evaluation (20-005)	
Audit report (20-008)	
Public summary (20-009)	Washington DNR public summary report was not published on BV website after more than three months (17 Sep 08) from the issuing of the certificate (15 May 08). CAR.BV.FM.USA.2008.01 BV had given timeline 1 year from main evaluation audit (28 June 2008). At this audit (December 2008) - according to the findings communicated to client - BV had closed five minor CARs and CAR 03 remained open. The summary report (25 Sept 08) published on BV website is not updated. Hence, the actions taken by the certificate holder to correct any outstanding non-compliances and the subsequent BV evaluation and decision are not clear. CAR.BV.FM.USA.2008.04
Application of FSC policies and guidelines	-

OPERATION'S COMPLIANCE WITH CERTIFICATION REQUIREMENTS	
FSC requirements	Findings and conclusions
Principle 1	-
Principle 2	-
Principle 3	-
Principle 4	-
Principle 5	CAR 03 on social impact assessment remains open. BV evaluated company's corrective action for maximization of potential stocking/growth within regeneration cuts.
Principle 6	WDNR has developed a policy for sustainable forestry.

	BV evaluated company's corrective action for regeneration harvest size and WDNR State Environmental Policy Act Guidance Handbook.
Principle 7	FM Plan completed and under approval from authority. ASI has no evidence that a FMP summary is publicly available. CAR.BV.FM.USA.2008.03
Principle 8	-
Principle 9	-
Principle 10	NA

5 Nonconformities and observations

Major CAR(s)	Minor CAR(s)	Observations
-	04	01

See nonconformity reports (attached) for details.

6 Conclusion and recommendation

BV conducted a systematic and professional assessment and addressed all issues in a professional manner.

Based on the findings of this assessment, the ASI assessor recommends to FSC AC the continuation of the FSC forest management accreditation for BV, subject to the timely closing of the nonconformities identified during the assessment and specified in the nonconformity reports (attached).

Attachments

- Nonconformity reports (NCRs)

ACCREDITATION SERVICES INTERNATIONAL GmbH

Charles-de-Gaulle-Str. 5 • 53113 Bonn, Germany • Tel.: +49 - 228 - 367 66 0 • info@accreditation-services.com

NONCONFORMITY / CORRECTIVE ACTION REQUEST

REF. No.	CAR.BV.FM.USA.2008.01	Date	02 December 2008	
Nonconformity detected by (name of assessor)		Paolo Tranquillini		
Through (e.g. office assessment, document review)		FM surveillance		
Nonconformity	Status	<input type="checkbox"/> MAJOR <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> MINOR <input type="checkbox"/> OBSERVATION		
The BV public summary report for Washington DNR was not published on BV website after more than three months (17 Sep 08) from the issuing of the certificate (15 May 08).				
Normative Reference(s)	FSC-STD-20-009 2.1			
Corrective Action Request: BV shall implement appropriate measures to correct the nonconformity detected in this assessment and described above within the given timeline. The measures shall be adequate to correct the current problems and to eliminating causes of nonconformities in order to avoid recurrence.				
Deadline for implementation		12 months from finalization of report		
Corrective Action implemented by Certification Body As part of the development of the public summary report the client gets to review and comment on the document. The Washington Department of Natural Resources undertook an extensive review of the document which lengthened the preparation process. → BV action plan: new requirement will be added in the BMS (5. Production – Certification – FSC Certification – 1. Introduction) and in the GP01 FSC FM (7.2 Certificate granting), and communicated to the client and the auditors by news letter and during the update training and see resolution of CAR.BV.FM.USA.2008.04.				
Corrective Action evaluated by ASI ASI will check implementation of the proposed preventive action.				
<input type="checkbox"/> CLOSED <input type="checkbox"/> UPGRADED <input type="checkbox"/> OTHER DECISION*	Name assessor:		Date:	
Comments:				

ACCREDITATION SERVICES INTERNATIONAL GmbH

Charles-de-Gaulle-Str. 5 • 53113 Bonn, Germany • Tel.: +49 - 228 - 367 66 0 • info@accreditation-services.com

NONCONFORMITY / CORRECTIVE ACTION REQUEST

REF. No.	CAR.BV.FM.USA.2008.02	Date	02 December 2008	
Nonconformity detected by (name of assessor)		Paolo Tranquillini		
Through (e.g. office assessment, document review)		FM surveillance		
Nonconformity		Status	<input type="checkbox"/> MAJOR <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> MINOR <input type="checkbox"/> OBSERVATION	
This audit at Washington DNR was presented as special surveillance. BV documented system does not define the special surveillance. Eg. if such special surveillance would be a supplementary visit (eg. to follow-up on issued CARs) or if it would account as one of the annual surveillances.				
Normative Reference(s)		FSC-STD-20-001, 20.1 – BV BMS v.3.0, 6. 'Surveillance audit realisation'		
Corrective Action Request: BV shall implement appropriate measures to correct the nonconformity detected in this assessment and described above within the given timeline. The measures shall be adequate to correct the current problems and to eliminating causes of nonconformities in order to avoid recurrence.				
Deadline for implementation		12 months from finalization of report		
Corrective Action implemented by Certification Body				
Special surveillance audit is not specified as such in the BMS, but Follow-up Audit is described in the Global BMS (5. Production – Audit Realisation – 6. Follow-up Visits). (Cfr attached document) <i>Root cause:</i> the auditor was not aware of this wording. → BV action plan: specification on Follow-up audits will be added in the BMS specific to FSC and communicated to the auditors by news letter and during the update training				
Corrective Action evaluated by ASI				
ASI will check implementation of the proposed corrective action.				
<input type="checkbox"/> CLOSED <input type="checkbox"/> UPGRADED <input type="checkbox"/> OTHER DECISION*		Name assessor:	Date:	
Comments:				

ACCREDITATION SERVICES INTERNATIONAL GmbH

Charles-de-Gaulle-Str. 5 • 53113 Bonn, Germany • Tel.: +49 - 228 - 367 66 0 • info@accreditation-services.com

NONCONFORMITY / CORRECTIVE ACTION REQUEST

REF. No.	CAR.BV.FM.USA.2008.03	Date	16 March 2009
Nonconformity detected by (name of assessor)		Paolo Tranquillini	
Through (e.g. office assessment, document review)		FM surveillance	
Nonconformity	Status	<input type="checkbox"/> MAJOR <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> MINOR <input type="checkbox"/> OBSERVATION	
There is no evidence of how the client had corrected BV NC 02 and how BV had evaluated compliance with FSC criterion 7.4.			
Normative Reference(s)	FSC criterion 7.4		
Corrective Action Request: BV shall implement appropriate measures to correct the nonconformity detected in this assessment and described above within the given timeline. The measures shall be adequate to correct the current problems and to eliminating causes of nonconformities in order to avoid recurrence.			
Deadline for implementation		12 months from finalization of report	
Corrective Action implemented by Certification Body The report <i>A Summary of the Current Management Strategies for the South Puget HCP Planning Unit</i> (November 08) was provided to the auditor (cfr attached document). This report is also available at web address: www.dnr.wa.gov/BusinessPermits/Topics/TimberSalesAuction/Pages/fm_forest . The report was reviewed by the auditor prior to the audit.			
Corrective Action evaluated by ASI The document does not refer to any existing forest management plan and to the elements of Criterion 7.1. It is also not clear if it is available to the public on request, as it is not available on the given address on DNR website. ASI still expects evidence that the document and its availability satisfy FSC criterion 7.4.			
<input type="checkbox"/> CLOSED <input type="checkbox"/> UPGRADED <input type="checkbox"/> OTHER DECISION*	Name assessor:		Date:
Comments:			

ACCREDITATION SERVICES INTERNATIONAL GmbH

Charles-de-Gaulle-Str. 5 • 53113 Bonn, Germany • Tel.: +49 - 228 - 367 66 0 • info@accreditation-services.com

NONCONFORMITY / CORRECTIVE ACTION REQUEST

REF. No.	CAR.BV.FM.USA.2008.04	Date	16 March 2009
Nonconformity detected by (name of assessor)		Paolo Tranquillini	
Through (e.g. office assessment, document review)		FM surveillance	
Nonconformity	Status	<input type="checkbox"/> MAJOR <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> MINOR <input type="checkbox"/> OBSERVATION	
The summary report (25 Sept 08) published on BV website is not updated. Hence, the actions taken by the certificate holder to correct any outstanding non-compliances and the subsequent BV evaluation and decision are not clear.			
Normative Reference(s)	FSC-STD-20-009, 7.2		
Corrective Action Request: BV shall implement appropriate measures to correct the nonconformity detected in this assessment and described above within the given timeline. The measures shall be adequate to correct the current problems and to eliminating causes of nonconformities in order to avoid recurrence.			
Deadline for implementation		12 months from finalization of report	
Corrective Action implemented by Certification Body			
Report has been updated by amending it with the Dec 08 audit results by Brian Callaghan March 31, 2009 and published on the website, April the 27th. <i>Root cause:</i> BV has no specific instructions regarding updating of public summaries on their website and its deadline. → BV action plan: FSC specific BMS will be reviewed (5. Production – Audit realization – FSC Audit Realisation – 7. Surveillance audit reporting) and instructions and tools on the follow-up of FSC FM audit are implemented. (see “Copie de SF21FM_hdh.xls” and “Copie de FM audit schedule 2009.xls”)			
Corrective Action evaluated by ASI			
Corrective action implemented. ASI issues this as minor CAR and will check implementation of the proposed preventive action.			
<input type="checkbox"/> CLOSED <input type="checkbox"/> UPGRADED <input type="checkbox"/> OTHER DECISION*	Name assessor:	Date:	
Comments:			

ACCREDITATION SERVICES INTERNATIONAL GmbH

Charles-de-Gaulle-Str. 5 • 53113 Bonn, Germany • Tel.: +49 - 228 - 367 66 0 • info@accreditation-services.com

NONCONFORMITY / CORRECTIVE ACTION REQUEST

REF. No.	REC.BV.FM.USA.2008.01	Date	02 December 2008
Nonconformity detected by (name of assessor)		Paolo Tranquillini	
Through (e.g. office assessment, document review)		FM surveillance	
Nonconformity	Status	<input type="checkbox"/> MAJOR <input type="checkbox"/> MINOR <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> OBSERVATION	
<p>The audit schedule should include the composition of the audit team, according to ISO 19011.</p>			