

ASI-ACCREDITATION SERVICES INTERNATIONAL GmbH

Charles-de-Gaulle-Str. 5 • 53113 Bonn, Germany • Tel.: +49 - 228 - 367 66 0 • accreditation@fsc.org

ASI Surveillance Forest Management Audit of Eurocertifor-BVQI

**Forest Management Audit to
Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201)
in Cameroon**

Date of audit: June 19 to 23, 2006

(Public summary)

**Richard Eba'a
Hubert de Bonafos
(ASI Accreditation Programme Manager)
05 September 2006**

**ASI Forest Management Surveillance Audit for Eurocertifor-BVQI:
Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201) in Cameroon.**

Table of contents

1 – General information	2
2 – The audit process	3
2.1 Objective of ASI audit	3
2.2 Stakeholder consultation by ASI audit team	3
2.2.1 Consultation process	3
2.2.2 Main concerns expressed by stakeholders	4
3 – Summary of findings	5
3.1 Background	5
3.2 Summary of corrective action requests (CAR) and recommendations resulting from this audit	5
3.3 Audit findings regarding the performance of the certification body in implementing FSC accreditation procedures	5
3.4 Audit findings regarding the performance of the certification body in evaluating compliance of the certificate holder with FSC certification requirements	7
3.5 Recommendations	10
4 – Overall conclusion	11
5 – Terms and definitions	12

**ASI Forest Management Surveillance Audit for Eurocertifor-BVQI:
Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201) in Cameroon.**

1 General information

The forest enterprise audited by Eurocertifor-BVQI

Name	Wijma Douala
Forest type	Tropical natural forest
Name of contact person	Mr Lassegue
Address	UFA 09 021 Arrondissement de Ma'an Departement Valle du N'tem Province du Sud
Country	Cameroon

ASI Audit Details

Date of audit	June 19 to 23, 2006
Purpose of audit	ASI surveillance forest management audit for FSC. (ASI surveillance audits are designed to monitor the implementation of FSC accreditation and certification requirements by FSC accredited certification bodies in the field. ASI procedures for surveillance audits are included in ASI QMS, procedure ASI-PRO-20-113 Surveillance).
ASI audit team	Hubert de Bonafos (ASI Accreditation Programme Manager, lead auditor) Richard Eba'a (ASI local expert)

2 The audit process

2.1 Objective of ASI audit

FSC accreditation audit	N/A
FSC normal surveillance audit	FSC annual FM surveillance audit for 2006
FSC spot audit	N/A

2.2 Stakeholder consultation by ASI audit team

2.2.1 Consultation process

ASI announced the surveillance audit on the FSC electronic fora for FSC National Initiatives, Certification Bodies and FSC members at the end of May 2006.

In addition, a stakeholder consultation process was carried out by the ASI audit team prior to the field audit. Selected stakeholders who had previously been consulted by Eurocertifor-BVQI were contacted by e-mail and interviewed by phone.

A large number of comments were received prior to the FSC surveillance audit.

ASI Forest Management Surveillance Audit for Eurocertifor-BVQI:
Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201) in Cameroon.

2.2.2 Main concerns expressed by stakeholders

Stakeholder Comments	ASI response
Certification process by BVQI was too short and not adequate.	The ASI audit team investigated this issue during the FSC surveillance audit. BVQI performed 1 pre-audit in March 2004, 1 initial audit in June 2005 and 1 complementary audit in November 2005 before issuing a certificate. This is in line with FSC accreditation requirements. However, the ASI audit team considers that BVQI did not comply with all FSC requirements and the certified company was not in line with FSC certification requirements at the time of the ASI surveillance audit. A number of major CARs have been proposed to address these issues. See section 3 below.
Illegal timber can be found in the certified FMU. The certified company did not take appropriate measures to address this issue.	The ASI audit team investigated this issue. Small timber illegally sawn by third parties was found in the certified FMU. At the time of the FSC surveillance audit, the procedures of the company had not been implemented and were not appropriate to address such issue. A major CAR has been proposed to address this issue CAR.BVQI.FM.2006.04.
Some conflicts exist regarding the limits of the certified FMU.	The ASI audit team investigated this issue and participated in the interview of a number of stakeholders. During the audit, ASI audit team participated to interviews with Wijma, the "Comite de suivi", NGOs and people from the villages concerned. The interviews indicated that the issues had been adequately dealt with by the company and that appropriate procedures and consultation had been followed. All people interviewed stated that they did not have any problem with the procedure followed and that they were now waiting for a decision from the administration. Regarding the Community Forestry, the NGO SAGED is currently in contact with the company to finalise the resolution of this conflict.
Land use rights, rights of way and customary rights of indigenous communities.	The ASI audit team checked that a well qualified and recognized professional had been contracted by the company to contact the indigenous community and report on

**ASI Forest Management Surveillance Audit for Eurocertifor-BVQI:
Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201) in Cameroon.**

	<p>their activities, needs and potential impacts of forestry activities in the certified FMU.</p> <p>The company confirmed that right of way and customary rights were guaranteed and the ASI audit team did not receive any comment and could not find evidence that this was not the case.</p>
Other comments received are attached in the confidential annex 1 to the internal ASI report.	All comments received were investigated and were included in ASI audit.

3 Summary of findings

3.1 Background

During this ASI surveillance audit of Eurocertifor-BVQI, the ASI audit team identified a number of non-compliances that have been addressed and fully documented in ASI final surveillance report. All areas of concern related to the interpretation and implementation of FSC certification procedures and requirements were addressed by the Corrective Action Requests (CAR) presented below.

3.2 Summary of corrective action requests (CAR) and recommendations resulting from this audit (*)

Major CARs	Minor CARs	Recommendations
5	10	2

Eurocertifor-BVQI shall implement appropriate measures to correct the following nonconformities and to prevent re-occurrence, within the given timelines.

3.3 Audit findings regarding the performance of the certification body in implementing FSC accreditation procedures

3.3.1 Audit team

BVQI audit team was appropriate, in compliance with FSC requirements.

3.3.2 Audit time

Audit time was adequate for all BVQI audits; pre-audit (March 2004), initial certification audit (June 2005), complementary audit (November 2005) and surveillance audit (June 2006).

3.3.3 Stakeholder consultation process

The ASI audit team proposed the following corrective action request:

* See section 5 for Terms and Definitions

**ASI Forest Management Surveillance Audit for Eurocertifor-BVQI:
Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201) in Cameroon.**

Nonconformity	At the time of this ASI surveillance audit BVQI had not contacted all relevant national stakeholders and had not responded to stakeholders to inform them on how the concerns they raised had been taken into account for the certification of Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201).
	Minor
CAR.BVQI.FM.2006.01	BVQI shall demonstrate compliance with FSC-STD-20-006, sections 1 and 7.3.
Reference	FSC-STD-20-006, sections 1 and 7.3
Timeline	Next office surveillance audit (ASI perform annual surveillance audits of FSC accredited certification bodies. ASI verifies compliance with minor corrective action request during these annual office surveillance audits).

3.3.4 Local adaptation of certification body's standard

Prior to the certification audit of the company, BVQI adequately adapted its generic standard.

3.3.5 Certification reports

The ASI audit team proposed the following corrective action requests:

Nonconformity	At the time of the ASI surveillance audit, 6 months after BVQI positive certification decision for Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201), BVQI had not published on its website the public summary report in one of FSC official languages. A minor CAR was previously issued to Eurocertifor-BVQI requesting for this issue to be addressed.
	Major
CAR.BVQI.FM.2006.13	BVQI shall publish its public summary report for Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201) in one of FSC official languages.
Reference	FSC-STD-20-009, section 1.1
Timeline	1 month from finalization of this report

Nonconformity	BVQI certified only one FMU out of a total of 4 FMUs managed by Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201). However, BVQI audit reports (initial and complementary audits) do not include a description of the areas of forest that the certificate holder has chosen not to include in the scope of the certificate
	Minor
CAR.BVQI.FM.2006.14	BVQI shall review its public summary report for Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201) to add the information requested under FSC-STD-20-009, section 6.
Reference	FSC-STD-20-009, section 6
Timeline	Next office surveillance audit

**ASI Forest Management Surveillance Audit for Eurocertifor-BVQI:
Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201) in Cameroon.**

3.3.6 Identification and follow-up on nonconformities

The ASI audit team proposed the following corrective action request:

Nonconformity	During the certification process of Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201), BVQI transformed 2 major CARs in minor CARs without sufficient objective evidence following the complementary audit which was performed in November 2005.
	Minor
CAR.BVQI.FM.2006.02	BVQI shall demonstrate compliance with FSC-STD-20-002, sections 8.3.2 and 8.3.3.
Reference	FSC-STD-20-002, sections 8.3.2 and 8.3.3
Timeline	Next office surveillance audit

3.3.7 Peer review

The ASI audit team proposed the following corrective action request:

Nonconformity	BVQI peer reviewer process for the certification of Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201) was not in compliance with FSC requirements.
	Minor
CAR.BVQI.FM.2006.15	BVQI shall demonstrate compliance with FSC requirements for peer reviews for the certification of Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201).
Reference	FSC-STD-20-001, section 18
Timeline	Next office surveillance audit.

3.4 Audit findings regarding the performance of the certification body in evaluating compliance of the certificate holder with FSC certification requirements

3.4.1 FSC Principle 1 (Compliance with laws and FSC Principles)

The ASI audit team proposed the following corrective action requests:

Nonconformity	During the certification process of Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201), BVQI audit team did not appropriately evaluate compliance with BVQI indicator 1.1.6.
	Minor
CAR.BVQI.FM.2006.03	BVQI shall demonstrate that Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201) is in compliance with indicator 1.1.6.
Reference	BVQI Referentiel de Gestion Forestiere adapte pour le Cameroun, version 1.0, Decembre 2005, BVQI indicator 1.1.6.
Timeline	Next office surveillance audit

**ASI Forest Management Surveillance Audit for Eurocertifor-BVQI:
Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201) in Cameroon.**

Nonconformity	During the certification process of Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201), BVQI audit team did not appropriately evaluate compliance with FSC criterion 1.5. This resulted in major issues not addressed by the certified company at the time of the FSC surveillance audit.
	Major
CAR.BVQI.FM.2006.04	BVQI shall demonstrate that Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201) is in compliance with FSC criterion 1.5.
Reference	FSC Principle and Criteria, criterion 1.5
Timeline	3 months from finalization of this report

3.4.2 FSC Principle 2 (Tenure and use rights and responsibilities)

Based on the findings of the audit, the ASI audit team considers that the company had been appropriately evaluated against FSC Principle 2 certification requirements.

3.4.3 FSC Principle 3 (Indigenous peoples' rights)

Based on the findings of the audit, the ASI audit team considers that the company had been appropriately evaluated against FSC Principle 3 certification requirements.

3.4.4 FSC Principle 4 (Community relations and worker's rights)

The ASI audit team proposed the following corrective action requests:

Nonconformity	During the certification process of Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201), BVQI audit team did not appropriately evaluate compliance with FSC criterion 4.2. This resulted in major issues not addressed by the certified company at the time of the FSC surveillance audit.
	Major
CAR.BVQI.FM.2006.05	BVQI shall demonstrate that Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201) is in compliance with FSC criterion 4.2.
Reference	FSC Principles and Criteria, criterion 4.2
Timeline	3 months from finalization of this report

Nonconformity	During the certification process of Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201), BVQI audit team did not appropriately evaluate compliance with FSC criterion 4.5.
	Minor
CAR.BVQI.FM.2006.06	BVQI shall demonstrate that Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201) is in compliance with FSC criterion 4.5.
Reference	FSC Principles and Criteria, criterion 4.5
Timeline	Next office surveillance audit

**ASI Forest Management Surveillance Audit for Eurocertifor-BVQI:
Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201) in Cameroon.**

Observation	At the time of this surveillance audit, Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201) subcontractors did not have any staff representatives and it was not clear for the ASI audit team whether the company was in compliance with BVQI indicator 4.3.3 for forest workers.
REC.BVQI.FM.2006.01	BVQI should ensure that Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201) is in compliance with BVQI indicator 4.3.3.

3.4.5 FSC Principle 5 (Benefits from the forest)

The ASI audit team proposed the following recommendation:

Observation	At the time of the ASI surveillance audit, the ASI audit team did not find evidence that BVQI had evaluated compliance of Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201) with the standard's indicators related to NTFPs.
REC.BVQI.FM.2006.02	BVQI should ensure that Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201) is in compliance with BVQI indicators related to NTFPs.

3.4.6 FSC Principle 6 (Environmental impact)

The ASI audit team proposed the following corrective action requests:

Nonconformity	During the certification process of Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201), BVQI audit team did not appropriately evaluate compliance with FSC criteria 6.1 and 6.5.
	Minor
CAR.BVQI.FM.2006.07	BVQI shall demonstrate that Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201) is in compliance with FSC criteria 6.1 and 6.5.
Reference	FSC Principles and Criteria, criteria 6.1 and 6.5
Timeline	Next office surveillance audit

Nonconformity	During the certification process of Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201), BVQI audit team did not appropriately evaluate compliance with FSC criterion 6.2.
	Minor
CAR.BVQI.FM.2006.08	BVQI shall demonstrate that Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201) is in compliance with FSC criterion 6.2.
Reference	FSC Principles and Criteria, criterion 6.2
Timeline	Next office surveillance audit

**ASI Forest Management Surveillance Audit for Eurocertifor-BVQI:
Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201) in Cameroon.**

Nonconformity	During the certification process of Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201), BVQI audit team did not appropriately evaluate compliance with FSC criterion 6.7.
	Minor
CAR.BVQI.FM.2006.09	BVQI shall demonstrate that Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201) is in compliance with FSC criterion 6.7.
Reference	FSC Principles and Criteria, criterion 6.7
Timeline	Next office surveillance audit

3.4.7 FSC Principle 7 (Management plan)

The ASI audit team proposed the following corrective action request:

Nonconformity	During the certification process of Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201), BVQI audit team did not appropriately evaluate compliance with FSC criterion 7.3.
	Minor
CAR.BVQI.FM.2006.10	BVQI shall demonstrate that Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201) is in compliance with FSC criterion 7.3.
Reference	FSC Principles and Criteria, criterion 7.3
Timeline	Next office surveillance audit

3.4.8 FSC Principle 8 (Monitoring and assessment)

The ASI audit team proposed the following corrective action request:

Nonconformity	During the certification process of Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201), BVQI audit team did not appropriately evaluate compliance with FSC-STD-30-010 and FSC-STD-40-005. This resulted in major issues not addressed by the certified company at the time of the FSC surveillance audit.
	Major
CAR.BVQI.FM.2006.12	BVQI shall demonstrate that Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201) is in compliance with FSC-STD-30-010 and FSC-STD-40-005.
Reference	FSC-STD-30-010 and FSC-STD-40-005.
Timeline	3 months from finalization of this report

3.4.9 FSC Principle 9 (Maintenance of high conservation value forests)

The ASI audit team proposed the following corrective action request:

**ASI Forest Management Surveillance Audit for Eurocertifor-BVQI:
Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201) in Cameroon.**

Nonconformity	During the certification process of Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201), BVQI audit team did not appropriately evaluate compliance with FSC Principle 9. This resulted in major issues not addressed by the certified company at the time of the FSC surveillance audit.
	Major
CAR.BVQI.FM.2006.11	BVQI shall demonstrate that Wijma Douala (EUR-FM/COC-051201) is in compliance with FSC Principle 9.
Reference	FSC Principles and Criteria, Principle 9.
Timeline	3 months from finalization of this report

4 Overall Conclusion

4.1 Implementation of CB documented certification system and procedures

The implementation of some of BVQI documented certification procedures was not adequate.

See the following CARs proposed by the ASI audit team:

- **CAR.BVQI.FM.2006.01**
- **CAR.BVQI.FM.2006.02**
- **CAR.BVQI.FM.2006.13**
- **CAR.BVQI.FM.2006.14**
- **CAR.BVQI.FM.2006.15**

4.2 Evaluation by Certification Body of Certificate holder's compliance with FSC Principles and Criteria

ASI audit team considers that at time of the FSC surveillance audit, the certification body had not adequately evaluated compliance of the certificate holder with the following FSC certification requirements. The certification body had not requested appropriate corrective actions.

See the following CARs proposed by the ASI audit team:

- **CAR.BVQI.FM.2006.03**
- **CAR.BVQI.FM.2006.04**
- **CAR.BVQI.FM.2006.05**
- **CAR.BVQI.FM.2006.06**
- **CAR.BVQI.FM.2006.07**
- **CAR.BVQI.FM.2006.08**
- **CAR.BVQI.FM.2006.09**
- **CAR.BVQI.FM.2006.10**
- **CAR.BVQI.FM.2006.11**
- **CAR.BVQI.FM.2006.12**

5 Terms and definitions

Nonconformity: The absence of, or the failure to implement and maintain, one or more management system requirements of the reference standards, or a situation which would, on the basis of available objective evidence raise significant doubt as to the credibility of the certificates issued by the applicant body. ASI procedures for nonconformity and corrective action requests are included in ASI QMS, procedure **ASI-PRO-20-116 Corrective action procedure.**

Note:

- A “nonconformance” is a product that does not meet specifications;
- A “nonconformity” is a process that does not meet specifications.

According to their severity, nonconformity is graded into three categories:

Major Nonconformity (Category 1)

“A systematic failure or significant deficiency -either as a single incident or a combination of a number of similar incidents- in a significant part of the quality system, or the lack of implementation of such a part, governed by applicable standards. A number of minor nonconformities against one requirement of the reference standards can represent a total breakdown of the system and thus be considered a major nonconformity.”

Minor Nonconformity (Category 2)

“An isolated or sporadic lapse in the content or implementation of procedures or records which could reasonable lead to failure of the system if not corrected. If a pattern of minor nonconformities occurs over successive assessments, it may represent a total breakdown of the system and a major non-conformance shall be issued.”

Observation (Category 3)

“An area of concern, a process, document, or activity that is currently conforming that may if not improved, result in a nonconforming system, product or service. Observations shall be recorded in the audit report for the benefit of the customer.”